191730 - Is it prescribed not to do the prostration of forgetfulness in Jumu‘ah and Eid prayer?

the question

Dear brother i came to know from my father that prostration of forgetfulness should not b done during friday salah and eid, how far is it true i was going on searching it on ur website but i couldnt find it please provide me if any evidence.

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

Firstly:

We have previously discussed the ruling on Eid prayer in the answers to questions no. 48983 and 49014.

In the answer to question no. 45456 we stated that it is prescribed to do the prostration of forgetfulness (sujood as-sahw) in naafil prayers just as it is prescribed in obligatory prayers; it is exactly the same. This is the view of the majority of scholars.

That is because the basic principle is that it is prescribed to do the prostration of forgetfulness in prayer when there is the reason for doing it, and the Lawgiver made no differentiation between obligatory and naafil prayers in that regard.

Shaykh Ibn Baaz (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

The prostration of forgetfulness is prescribed in all prayers, both naafil and obligatory, because of the general meaning of the hadeeths.

End quote from Majmoo‘ Fataawa Ibn Baaz, 30;13.

There is no disagreement that Jumu‘ah prayer is obligatory, so the requirement to compensate for mistakes by doing the prostration of forgetfulness in this prayer is more certain.

With regard to Eid prayer, whether we say it is obligatory or naafil, it is like all other prayers; if a person makes a mistake he should compensate for it by doing the prostration of forgetfulness.

We have not found any one among the scholars, either the imams of the four madhhabs or other leading fuqaha’, who differentiate between the prayers and Jumu‘ah and Eid prayer, with regard to the prostration of forgetfulness.

However, the well-known view amongst the later Hanafis is that it is better not to do the prostration of forgetfulness in Jumu‘ah and Eid prayer if a large number of people are present, lest that confuse the worshippers, although in principle they also do not differentiate in the ruling on prostration of forgetfulness between obligatory and naafil prayers; rather they thought it was better not to do it with a large congregation for the reasons mentioned.

Burhaani ad-Deen al-Bukhaari al-Hanafi said in al-Muheet, 2/229:

It says in al-Asl: Making mistakes (or forgetting) in the Eid prayer, Jumu‘ah, obligatory and voluntary prayers is the same, because Jumu‘ah and Eid prayers are the same as other prayers with regard to what may spoil them, and they are the same with regard to what is required as compensation, except that our shaykhs said: They should not do the prostration of forgetfulness in Jumu‘ah and Eid prayers, lest that cause people to fall into confusion. End quote.

Abu Bakr al-Haddaadi said in al-Jawharah an-Nayyirah, 1/95:

Prostration of forgetfulness in Jumu‘ah, Eid and obligatory prayers is all the same; what is meant is that one should do the prostration of forgetfulness in all prayers (if required). But some of the shaykhs said that the imam should not do the prostration of forgetfulness in Jumu‘ah or Eid prayer lest he cause confusion to those who are far away from the imam. End quote.

Ibn ‘Aabideen said in al-Haashiyah, 2/157:

The favoured view among the later scholars is that he should not do the prostration of forgetfulness in Jumu‘ah and Eid prayer, lest the ignorant think that something has been added. This is what it says in as-Siraaj and elsewhere. But that does not mean that it is not permissible; rather it is better not to do it so that the people will not become confused. End quote.

It is clear from the words of Ibn ‘Aabideen and others that this opinion is only well-known among the later Hanafis. As for the imams of the madhhabs and the earlier scholars, this is not known from them; rather what is well known from them is the opposite, as is clear from the above. Muhammad ibn al-Hasan ash-Shaybaani, the companion of Imam Abu Haneefah, the propagator of his madhhab and the faqeeh of Iraq, said that the prostration of forgetfulness should be done (if required) in the Eid prayer, Jumu ah and all other prayers.

Abu Sulaymaan al-Jawzjaani said: I said – i.e., to Muhammad ibn al-Hasan – Do you think that the prostration of forgetfulness is the same in the Eid prayer, Jumu‘ah, and in the obligatory and voluntary prayers? He said: Yes.

Al-Mabsoot, 1/383

This is the correct view, which is in accordance with the opinion of the majority of scholars. What was quoted above from the later Hanafis is an opinion and juristic preference, but it is an opinion that is superseded.

The correct view is what is stated above, that the prostration of forgetfulness is prescribed in all prayers, whether obligatory or naafil, if the reason for doing it is present. There is no differentiation between Eid prayer, Jumu‘ah prayer, or any other prayer, whether obligatory or naafil.

And Allah knows best.