149415 - Ruling on eating all of the udhiyah or giving all of it in charity

the question

If a person slaughters two sheep for the ‘aqeeqah, or two sheep for the udhiyah (sacrifice), is it permissible for him to eat all of one of them and give all of the other in charity, so he does not give any of the first one in charity, but he gives all of the second one in charity, on behalf of both the first one and the second one, or must he give in charity something from each of them?

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

Firstly:

The Islamic texts indicate that it is obligatory to give some of the meat from the hadiy and udhiyah in charity, even if it is only a small amount. Allah, may He be exalted, says (interpretation of the meaning): “eat thereof, and feed the beggar who does not ask (men), and the beggar who asks (men). Thus have We made them subject to you that you may be grateful” [al-Hajj 22:36].

The “beggar who does not ask (men)” is the poor person who does not ask for help from others out of pride and dignity.

The “beggar who asks (men)” is the poor person who does ask for help from others.

These poor people have a right to the meat of the sacrificial animal. Although the report mentions the hadiy (sacrifice offered during Hajj), the same ruling applies to both the hadiy and the udhiyah (sacrifice offered on Eid al-Adha).

End quote from al-Mawsoo‘ah al-Fiqhiyyah (6/115)

The Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said concerning the udhiyah: “Eat some,

store some and give some in charity.” Narrated by Muslim (1971).

The view that it is obligatory to give some of it in charity is the view of the Shaafa‘is and Hanbalis, and it is the correct view, because of the apparent meaning of the shar‘i texts.

An-Nawawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

It is obligatory to give in charity as much as may be described as such, because the purpose is to show kindness to the poor and needy. Based on that, if a person eats all of it, he is liable for what may be described as a reasonable amount of charity.

End quote from Rawdat at-Taalibeen wa ‘Umdat al-Mufteen [?] (3/223)

Al-Mirdaawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

If he eats all of it, he is liable for the minimum share of it that is acceptable as charity.

End quote from al-Insaaf (6/491)

Al-Bahooti (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

If he does not give any part of it raw in charity, he is liable for the minimum share of it that may be regarded as a reasonable amount of charity, such as an ounce.

End quote from Kashshaaf al-Qinaa‘ (7/444).

Shaykh Ibn ‘Uthaymeen was asked about someone who cooks all the sacrificial meat with his relatives, without giving any of it in charity. Is their action valid?

He (may Allah have mercy on him) replied:

This is wrong, because Allah, may He be exalted, says (interpretation of the meaning): “That they may witness things that are of benefit to them (i.e. reward of Hajj in the Hereafter, and also some worldly gain from trade, etc.), and mention the Name of Allah on appointed days (i.e. 10th, 11th, 12th, and 13th day of Dhul-Hijjah), over the beast of cattle that He has provided for them (for

sacrifice) (at the time of their slaughtering by saying: Bismillah, Wallahu-Akbar, Allahumma Minka wa Ilaik). Then eat thereof and feed therewith the poor who have a very hard time" [al-Hajj 22:28].

Based on that, what they must do now is make up for what they ate themselves, by giving some meat for each sheep, which they may buy and give in charity.

End quote from Majmoo' Fataawa Ibn 'Uthaymeen (25/132)

Secondly:

With regard to whether it is obligatory to eat from one's sacrifice, there is a difference of scholarly opinion. The majority of scholars are of the view that eating from it is mustahabb (encouraged) but is not obligatory. This is the view of the four imams.

Some scholars are of the view that it is obligatory to eat from it, even if it is only a small amount, because of the apparent meaning of the shar'i texts which enjoin eating from it.

An-Nawawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

With regard to eating from it, it is mustahabb and not obligatory. This is our view and the view of all the scholars, apart from what was narrated from some of the earlier generation, that they regarded it is obligatory to eat from it, because of the apparent meaning of this hadith which enjoins eating from it, in addition to the verse in which Allah, may He be exalted, says (interpretation of the meaning): "eat thereof" [al-Hajj 22:36]. However the majority interpreted this command as meaning that it is recommended or permitted to eat from it.

End quote from Sharh Saheeh Muslim (13/131).

Ibn Qudaamah (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

If he gives all of it in charity, or most of it, that is permissible.

End quote from al-Mughni (13/380)

See also the answer to question no. 146159

Thirdly:

With regard to the ‘aqeeqah, there is nothing in the shar‘i texts to indicate how it is to be distributed, or whether it is obligatory to eat from it or give it in charity.

Therefore the individual may do whatever he likes with it: if he wishes he may give all of it in charity, or if he wishes he may eat all of it, but it is preferable to do with it as is done with the udhiyah.

Imam Ahmad was asked about the ‘aqeeqah and what is to be done with it.

He said:

Whatever you wish. Ibn Sireen used to say: Do whatever you wish.

End quote from Tuhfat al-Mawdood bi Ahkaam al-Mawlood (p. 55)

See also the answers to questions no. 8423 and 90029

Fourthly:

The ruling mentioned above, having to do with the obligation of giving in charity some of the udhiyah, or whether it is mustahabb or obligatory to eat from it, applies to each individual sheep.

So if a person slaughters ten sheep, he must give part of each one in charity, and it is mustahabb for him to eat something from each sheep.

It is not acceptable for him to give in charity one entire sheep out of this number on behalf of all of them, because each sheep is a separate sacrifice, independent of the others.

Therefore, when the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) slaughtered his sacrificial animals, he instructed that a piece from each camel be collected in the cooking pot. Jaabir ibn ‘Abdullah (may Allah be pleased with him) said: Then he went to the place of slaughter and

slaughtered sixty-three camels with his own hand, then he gave the knife to ‘Ali and he slaughtered the remaining camels. Then he ordered that a piece from each sacrificial animal be brought; (the pieces) were put in a pot and cooked, and they [the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) and ‘Ali] ate from the meat and drank from the soup… Narrated by Muslim (1218).

This indicates that a separate ruling applies to each animal slaughtered, hence he instructed that a piece be collected from each animal.

An-Nawawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

This indicates that it is mustahabb to eat from the hadiy and udhiyah.

The scholars said: Because eating from each one is Sunnah, and eating from each one of the hundred separately was too difficult, a piece from each one was put into a pot, so that he could eat from the soup of all of them which would contain part of each one.

End quote from Sharh Saheeh Muslim (8/192)

He (may Allah have mercy on him) also said:

He only took a piece from each animal and drank from the soup made from all of them so that he would have eaten something from each one of them.

End quote from al-Majmoo‘ Sharh al-Muhadhdhab (8/414)

Conclusion:

If you ate the entire udhiyah, and did not give any of it in charity, you have to buy some meat, even if it is only an ounce, and give it in charity to the poor, to compensate for that.

With regard to the udhiyah that you gave entirely in charity, that is acceptable according to all scholars.

With regard to the ‘aqeeqah, there is no blame on you for what you did with it.

And Allah knows best.