505083 - Does intentionally thinking about arousing thoughts until ejaculation invalidate fasting according to the Hanbali school?

the question

I sent a question asking, "What is the ruling on someone who ejaculates during day in Ramadan by deliberately prolonging thoughts with the intention of ejaculating?" You answered that it was previously answered and that his fast is valid because it falls under the forgiven inner thoughts, and that the Hanbalis said it cannot be avoided. This applies to someone who is overcome by thoughts and ejaculates, which I have no issue with.

My question is about the second aspect, which is deliberately or exaggeratedly thinking until ejaculation, as it is prohibited and not forgiven, and can be avoided. You mentioned in one of the answers that "If one deliberately thinks and indulges in it with the intention of ejaculating, there is no difference between it and one who deliberately looks with the intention of ejaculating." In the opinion of the Hanafis and Shafi'is, it is clear to me that his fast is valid because they consider the fast of one who ejaculates by looking to be valid. However, my question is about the Hanbali school in their statement that the fast of one who repeatedly looks and ejaculates is invalidated. Is there a difference between the two cases according to the Hanbalis, or is ejaculation by thought absolutely valid, whether deliberate and exaggerated or unintentional? This is what I wanted to become clear regarding the ruling ejaculation by thought according to the Hanbalis. May Allah reward you with the best reward.

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

First: The majority of Hanbali scholars hold that fasting is not invalidated by thinking, whether it occurs spontaneously or is deliberately indulged in by the person, and their evidence for this is that thinking is forgiven.

Some of them held that fasting is invalidated by thinking if one indulges in it and ejaculates, but if it occurs to him and he does not indulge in it, his fast is not invalidated.

Ibn Qudamah (may Allah have mercy on him(said: If one thinks and ejaculates, his fast is not invalidated.

It was reported from Abu Hafs Al-Barmaki (may Allah have mercy on him(that it does invalidate the fast. Ibn `Aqil chose this opinion, arguing that thought can be summoned, so it falls under one's control, as evidenced by the sin of harboring it in innovation and disbelief, and Allah's praise for those who reflect on the creation of the heavens and earth. The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) forbade thinking about the essence of Allah and ordered to think about His blessings. If it were not under one's control, these would not apply to it, as in the case of wet dreams.

However, if the image of the act occurs in his heart and he ejaculates, his fast is not invalidated because the thought cannot be repelled.

Our evidence (i.e., the evidence of the majority of Hanbalis) is the saying of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him): "My nation has been pardoned for mistakes, forgetfulness, and what their souls whisper to them, as long as they do not act upon it or speak about it."

Also, there is no explicit text or consensus on breaking the fast due to this. Thinking about sexual matters cannot be compared to direct physical contact (foreplay) or repeated looking, as it is less likely to arouse desire and lead to ejaculation. It differs from them and becomes prohibited when it involves a non-Mahram woman, or disliked when it involves one's wife. Therefore, it remains permissible according to the original ruling. (End quote from Al-Mughni, 4/364)

Al-Mardawi (may Allah have mercy on him(said: "His statement: 'If one thinks and ejaculates, it does not invalidate his fast.' The same applies if one thinks and has pre-seminal fluid emission." This is the correct view in both cases according to the Hanbali school. It is the apparent meaning of Imam Ahmad's words, and it is the opinion held by most of his companions.

In *Al-Furu`*, he said: "It is the most well-known view." Az-Zarkashi (may Allah have mercy on him(said: This is the more correct of the two views.

Abu Hafs Al-Barmaki and Ibn `Aqil (may Allah have mercy on them(said: One's fast is broken by ejaculation and pre-seminal fluid if it occurs due to one's thoughts.

It was also said: One's fast is broken by both if one deliberately sought them, otherwise not. (End quote from *Al-Insaf*, 7/430).

From the preceding quotations, it becomes known that distinguishing between deliberately thinking about and summoning the thought, and being overwhelmed by the thought, such that the former breaks the fast while the latter does not, is not the approved view in the Hanbali school. Rather, the correct view in the school is that they are the same, and neither of them breaks the fast.

Even though he caused the thought to be summoned until he ejaculated, they say that making this a reason for breaking the fast has no clear evidence.

Ibn An-Najjar (may Allah have mercy on him(said: "(Or if he thought and ejaculated)" meaning that his fast is not invalidated by this, according to the most correct opinion. This is because it is ejaculation without direct contact (foreplay) or looking, so it is similar to a wet dream or an overwhelming thought. As for this being caused by him, it is acknowledged. However, making it a reason for breaking the fast is not based on any text or consensus, and it is less than direct contact (foreplay) or looking. (End quote from *Mu`unat Uli An-Nuha*, 3/396).

Shaykh Ibn `Uthaymin (may Allah have mercy on him(said: His statement "or if he thought and ejaculated" means: He thought about intercourse and ejaculated, whether he has a wife and thought about intercourse with his wife, or he does not have a wife and thought about intercourse in general, then ejaculated. This does not invalidate his fast.

The evidence for this is the saying of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him): "Allah has forgiven my nation for what their souls whisper to them, as long as they do not act upon

it or speak about it." (Narrated by Al-Bukhari and Muslim) This person did not act or speak, he only thought to himself and ejaculated.

It is understood from his statement "he thought and ejaculated" that if any action occurs from him, it breaks the fast. For example, if he rubs against the ground until he ejaculates, or moves his private part until he ejaculates, or kisses his wife until he ejaculates, or similar actions, it breaks the fast. (End quote from *Ash-Sharh Al-Mumti`*, 6/391).

Second, the fact that thinking does not break the fast does not mean that a person should leave himself to evil thoughts and occupy his heart with thinking about such trivial matters. Rather, what is prescribed for him is to occupy his heart, mind, and sight with what benefits him and is good for his religion and worldly affairs.

It states in the Fatwas of the Permanent Committee: If a thought occurs to a person and he thinks about intercourse spontaneously, there is no blame on him, Allah willing. This is based on the authentic Hadith narrated by Abu Hurayrah (may Allah be pleased with him) that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) said: "Allah has forgiven my nation for what their souls whisper to them." In another narration: "What their souls speak to themselves, as long as they do not act upon it or speak of it."

However, if someone thinks and ejaculates due to deriving pleasure from the thought, he must perform Ghusl (ritual bath) because the ruling of Janabah (ritual impurity) applies to him in this case.

As for deliberately engaging in such thoughts and seeking them from time to time, this is not permissible and does not befit the character of a Muslim. It contradicts complete chivalry. A Muslim should refrain from it and occupy himself with what diverts him from arousing his desire, with what benefits him in his religion and worldly affairs. Moreover, deliberately arousing oneself through impermissible means is harmful to physical and mental health, and it is feared that it may lead to undesirable consequences.

The matter becomes even more reprehensible for someone who deliberately does this while Allah

has blessed him with a wife. Whenever a husband becomes accustomed to this shameful behavior and makes it a playground for his thoughts, the stability of the relationship and the tranquility and mercy that Allah has placed between spouses are at risk.

May Allah grant success, and may Allah's peace and blessings be upon our Prophet Muhammad, his family, and his Companions.

The Permanent Committee for Scholarly Research and Ifta': Bakr Abu Zayd, `Abd Al-`Aziz Al Ash-Shaykh, Salih Al-Fawzan, `Abdullah ibn Ghudayyan, `Abd Al-`Aziz ibn `Abdullah ibn Baz. (End quote from *Fatwa Al-Lajnah Ad-Da'imah,* 22/66).

In summary: The well-known opinion in the Hanbali school is that if someone thinks until he ejaculates, their fast remains valid, whether the thought overcame them, or they deliberately entertained it. However, this does not mean that a person should indulge in such thoughts. Rather, one should occupy themselves with what benefits them and what is good for them in this world and the Hereafter.

And Allah knows best.