382031 - She did not feel comfortable living in Madinah, so she left the city; has she done anything wrong?

the question

Does not liking [to live in] the city of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) lead to a person going astray? I was in the city of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) but I did not feel comfortable staying there, so I left, but I was misguided, then I repented when I left.

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

Firstly:

The virtue of living in Madinah

Living in the city of the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah) and bearing with patience its hardships, meaning its difficulties, is an act of great and proven virtue. The proof includes the report narrated by Muslim (1363) from Sa`d, who said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “I declare sacred what is between the two lava fields of Madinah, (and I forbid) cutting of its thorny trees and shrubs or killing of its game.” And he said: “Madinah is better for them, if only they knew. No one leaves it out of dislike for it but Allah will put someone better than him in his place, and no one stands firm despite its hardships and difficulties, but I will intercede for him, or be a witness for him, on the Day of Resurrection.”

And Muslim (1381) narrated from Abu Hurayrah that the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “There will come a time when a man will call his paternal cousin and his relative, saying: Come to a life of ease, come to a life of ease; but Madinah is better for them, if

only they knew. By the One in Whose hand is my soul, no one of them departs out of dislike for it, but Allah will replace him therein with one who is better than him. Verily Madinah is like a bellows: it eliminates dross. The Hour will not begin until Madinah eliminates its evil ones as the bellows eliminates the dross of iron."

Some of the scholars were of the view that the Prophet's words "Madinah eliminates its evil ones" do not apply in all eras.

Al-Qadi `Iyad (may Allah have mercy on him) said: It is as if this applied only at his time, because no one had the patience to migrate and stay there except one who had strong faith.

An-Nawawi said: This is not necessarily so, because according to the report narrated by Muslim, "The Hour will not begin until Madinah eliminates its evil ones as the bellows eliminates the dross of iron." This, and Allah knows best, refers to the time of the Dajjal. End quote.

Ibn Hajar said, commenting on that:

It may be that what is meant is that the hadith refers to both of these eras, and it was like that during the lifetime of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) for the reason mentioned. That is supported by the story of the Bedouin that comes a few chapters later, so the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said this to explain why the Bedouin left and asked him to cancel his oath of allegiance.

Then that will happen again at the end of time; when the Dajjal approaches Madinah, it will be shaken with its people, and there will be left no hypocrite or disbeliever but he will go out and join him, as is also explained in subsequent chapters.

As for the times in between, that is not applicable.(*Fath al-Bari*, 6/100).

Secondly:

Ruling on living in Madinah and moving away from it

There is no blame on someone who lived outside Madinah, then lived there for work or as a visitor, if he leaves after that.

Al-Baji said in *Al-Muntaqa* (7/190): Regarding the Prophet's words "No one leaves it out of dislike for it", it may be that what he (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) meant was not caring about the reward of the one who resides in it.

As for one who leaves because of hard times or turmoil, he does not come under the heading of those who leave it out of dislike for it.

Al-Qadi Abu'l-Walid (may Allah be pleased with him) said: What appears to me to be the case is that what he meant was the resident whose homeland it is leaving it to go and live somewhere else. As for the one whose homeland was elsewhere, then he came to Madinah seeking to draw close to Allah or as a traveller, then left it and went back to his homeland or on some other journey, then he does not come under the heading of those who leave it out of dislike for it.

Regarding the Prophet's words "but Allah will replace him therein with one who is better than him", it may be that what is meant is that Allah will bring someone better than him to come and reside in it, either someone who moves to it from elsewhere or a child who is born in the city. End quote.

Conclusion:

If Madinah was not your homeland, and you did not settle there or like to stay there, then there is no blame on you, in sha Allah, and there is nothing wrong with you going back to your homeland or place of residence where you were settled.

What matters with regard to all of that is a person's deeds and efforts to please his Lord. That is more important than how great or holy the land is.

Imam Malik narrated in *Al-Muwatta'* (4/1117) from Yahya ibn Sa`id that Abu'd-Darda' wrote to

Salman al-Farisi saying: Come to the holy land. Salman wrote back to him saying: The land does not make anyone holy; rather what makes a person holy is his deeds.

And Allah knows best.