333281 - The story of the killing and mutilation of Umm Qirfah is a false story that is not sound in either its chain of narration or its text

the question

What is the story of Umm Qirfah, in detail?

Summary of answer

Umm Qirfah al-Fazariyyah is Fatimah bint Rabi`ah ibn Badr. Her story has become widely known among the enemies of Islam, and they have started to use it to attack Islam and accuse it of being violent and cruel.
The chains of narrators of this story are all weak and are not sound, and what is mentioned in this story about her being mutilated and torn in two is very odd and weird. Hence it is not permissible to mention this story, except by way of warning against it.

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

The reality of the story of Umm Qirfah al-Fazariyyah

Umm Qirfah al-Fazariyyah is Fatimah bint Rabi`ah ibn Badr.

Her story has become widely known among the enemies of Islam, and they have started to use it to attack Islam and accuse it of being violent and cruel.

The reports of this story, which speaks of how she was killed and mutilated, are not sound in their chain of narrations, in addition to the fact that their texts are very weird. These reports include:

Firstly:

The report narrated by At-Tabari in *Tarikh ar-Rusul wal-Muluk* (2/643) with his isnad. He said:

Ibn Humayd told us: Salamah told us: Ibn Is-haq told me, from `Abdullah ibn Abi Bakr, who said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) sent Zayd ibn Harithah to Wadi al-Qura, where he met Banu Fazarah; some of his companions were killed there, and Zayd was wounded and was carried away from among the slain. Ward ibn `Amr, one of Banu Sa`d Banu Hudhaym, was also wounded there, by one of Banu Badr. When Zayd came [to Madinah], he vowed that no ghusl for janabah would touch his head until he led a campaign against Fazarah. When he recovered from his wounds, the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) sent him with an army to Banu Fazarah. He met them in Wadi al-Qura and killed some of them; Qays ibn al-Musahhir al-Ya`muri killed Mas`adah ibn Hikmah ibn Malik ibn Badr and captured Umm Qirfah –Fatimah bint Rabi`ah ibn Badr, who was married to Malik ibn Hudhayfah ibn Badr – who was an old woman, and a daughter of hers, along with `Abdullah ibn Mas`adah. Zayd ibn Harithah was instructed to execute Umm Qirfah, and he executed her in a very violent manner; he tied two ropes to her legs, then he tied them to two camels [which he drove in two different directions] until they tore her apart.

End quote from *Tarikh ar-Rusul wal-Muluk* (2/643).

This hadith is not sound in terms of its chain of narrators, and its text is odd and weird.

As for its chain of narrators, it is interrupted and its narrators are weak.

It is one of the report narrated by `Abdullah ibn Abi Bakr ibn Muhammad ibn `Amr ibn Hazm al-Ansari, who was one of the junior Tabi`in, so how could he have narrated the story [directly] from the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him)?

Its chain of narrators also includes Muhammad ibn Is-haq, who is mudallis [meaning that he deliberately made his reports ambiguous]. He narrated reports of strange stories that must be rejected, and there is a difference of scholarly opinion as to whether his reports are reliable or not.

Al-`Iraqi said in *Al-Mudallisin* (p. 81): He was one of those who narrated a lot of ambiguous

reports, especially from weak narrators.

End quote from *Al-Mudallisin* (p. 81).

Ibn Is-haq also narrated this report from Salamah ibn al-Fadl ar-Razi, who is weak. See: *Tahdhib at-Tahdhib* (4/154).

Muhammad ibn Humayd ar-Razi narrated it from Salamah, and his reports are to be rejected. See: *Tahdhib at-Tahdhib* (9/131).

Adh-Dhahabi said in *Mizan al-I`tidal* (4/406) regarding this hadith: It is odd. *Mizan al-I`tidal* (4/406).

As for its text, it is also odd and is contrary to the authentic hadiths which forbid mutilating the bodies of the slain, and the hadiths which forbid killing women and children in war.

It was narrated that `Adiy ibn Thabit said: I heard `Abdullah ibn Yazid narrating from the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) that he forbade plunder and mutilation. Narrated by al-Bukhari (5516).

It was narrated that Buraydah (may Allah be pleased with him) said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “Fight in the name of Allah, for the sake of Allah. Fight those who disbelieve in Allah. Fight but do not steal from the war booty, do not act treacherously, do not mutilate (the enemy dead) and do not kill children.” Narrated by Muslim (1731).

Abu Dawud (2295) narrated that Rabah ibn Rabi` said: We were with the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) on a campaign, and he saw the people gathering around something, so he sent a man and told him: “Find out what these people have gathered around.” A man came and said: They have gathered around a slain woman. He said: “This one could not have been fighting.” Khalid ibn al-Walid was the one who was leading the vanguard, so he sent a man and told him: “Tell Khalid not to kill any woman or worker.” Classed as authentic by al-Albani in *Sahih Abu Dawud*.

Thirdly:

The report narrated in *As-Sunan Al-Kubra* by al-Bayhaqi (17/126) and in *Sunan ad-Daraqutni* (4/119) and elsewhere, according to which the one who killed her was Abu Bakr as-Siddiq (may Allah be pleased with him), because she disbelieved after having become Muslim and did not repent.

They both narrated from Sa`id ibn `Abd al-`Aziz at-Tanukhi that a woman called Umm Qirfah disbelieved after having become Muslim. Abu Bakr as-Siddiq (may Allah be pleased with him) asked her to repent, but she did not repent, so he issued orders that she be executed. But this chain of narrators is interrupted, because Sa`id ibn `Abd al-`Aziz was not a contemporary of Abu Bakr (may Allah be pleased with him).

Hence ash-Shafa`i, al-Bayhaqi and others classed this hadith as weak.

Ash-Shafa`i said: We should not rely on any report narrated by him, because he is weak according to the scholars of hadith. End quote.

Al-Bayhaqi said: It is weak because it is interrupted. It was narrated to us via two mursal isnaads [in which the Sahabi is not mentioned]. End quote.

Az-Zayla`i said in *Nasb ar-Rayah* (3/459): This Sa`id was not a contemporary of Abu Bakr, so [the chain of narrators] is interrupted. End quote.

Al-Bayhaqi narrated in *As-Sunan al-Kubra* (16955) via Sa`id ibn Mansur: Khalid ibn Yazid ibn Abi Malik ad-Damashqi told us: My father told me that Abu Bakr as-Siddiq (may Allah be pleased with him) killed a woman called Umm Qirfah during the Apostasy Wars (ar-Riddah).

This chain of narrators is weak; it includes Khalid ibn Yazid ad-Damashqi, who is weak. And it was said that his hadith is to be rejected.

See: *Tahdhib at-Tahdhib* (3/127).

His father was Yazid ibn `Abd ar-Rahman ibn Abi Malik ad-Damashqi; he was not a contemporary

of Abu Bakr (may Allah be pleased with him), so the chain of narrators is also interrupted.

Al-Hafiz Ibn Rajab (may Allah have mercy on him) said: The chains of narrators of this story are all interrupted. End quote from *Jami` al-`Ulum wal-Hikam* (1/439).

Conclusion: The chains of narrators of this story are all weak and are not sound, and what is mentioned in this story about her being mutilated and torn in two is very odd and weird. Hence it is not permissible to mention this story, except by way of warning against it.

And Allah knows best.