the question

×

What do the scholars say about the Hadith of `Aishah (may Allah be pleased with her), in which it says that she went out to At-Tan`im for `Umrah, and the Hadith of Ibn `Abbas (may Allah be pleased with him) in which it says, "Even the people of Makkah (Makkans) should enter Ihram from Makkah, those who want to do Hajj or `Umrah''? How can we reconcile these two Hadith? Please explain to us the correct view that is in accordance with the Quran and Sunnah. Where should the people of Makkah enter Ihram – from At-Tan`im or from Makkah itself?.

Summary of answer

The people of Makkah should enter Ihram for Hajj offered on its own or for Hajj and `Umrah offered together from Makkah, and they do not have to go outside the Haram or to one of the other Miqats. For `Umrah offered on its own, the one who wants to enter Ihram and is already in Makkah or within the boundaries of the Haram has to go outside the Haram – to At-Tan`im or elsewhere – and enter Ihram from there.

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

Explanation of the Miqat as defined by Prophet Muhammad

It is a good idea to quote the two Hadith first, then explain how they may be reconciled:

 It was narrated that Ibn `Abbas (may Allah be pleased with him) said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) defined the Miqat of the people of Madinah as Dhul-Hulayfah; that of the people of Sham (Greater Syria) as Al-Jahfah; that of the people of Najd as Qarn Al-Manazil; and that of the people of Yemen as Yalamlam. And he said: "And these Miqats are for the people at those very places, and besides them for those who come through those places with the intention of performing Hajj and `Umrah; and whoever is living within these boundaries can enter Ihram from the place he starts, and the people of Makkah can start from Makkah." (Narrated by Al-Bukhari and Muslim)

It was narrated that `Aishah (may Allah be pleased with her) said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) stopped at a place called Al-Mahasab. He called `Abd Ar-Rahman ibn Abu Bakr and said to him, `Take your sister out of the Haram (sanctuary) – according to another version: to At-Tan`im – and let her enter Ihram for `Umrah, then let her circumambulate the House, and I will wait for you both here.'" She said: "So we went out and I entered Ihram, then I circumambulated the House and did Sa`i between As-Safa and Al-Marwah. Then we came to the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) at his camp in the middle of the night, and he said, 'Have you finished?' I said, 'Yes.' He gave his companions permission to move on, and he went out to the Ka'bah and circumambulated it before Fajr prayer, then he left for Madinah." (Narrated by Al-Bukhari and Muslim)

Overview of the Hadith narrated by Ibn `Abbas

Based on this it may be said that the Hadith of Ibn `Abbas (may Allah be pleased with him) is general in application and means that the people of Makkah should enter Ihram from Makkah for either Hajj or `Umrah performed on its own or for Hajj and `Umrah together (Qiran)

Understanding the Hadith of `Aishah

×

The Hadith about `Aishah (may Allah be pleased with her) going out of the sanctuary (the Haram) with her brother `Abd Ar-Rahman to enter Ihram was a specific command issued by the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) to her alone.

Reconciling the Two Hadiths: General vs. Specific Rulings

The well-known principle according to the scholars is that if there seems to be a contradiction

×

between a general ruling and a specific ruling, then the specific outweighs the general, which in this case is entering lhram for `Umrah from At-Tan`im, or some other place outside the Haram.

So the phrase "and the people of Makkah from Makkah" means that the people of Makkah should enter Ihram for Hajj offered on its own or for Hajj and `Umrah offered together (Qiran) from Makkah, and they do not have to go outside the Haram or to one of the other Miqats mentioned in the Hadith, in order to enter Ihram from there.

In the case of `Umrah offered on its own, the one who wants to enter ihram and is already in Makkah or within the boundaries of the Haram has to go outside the Haram – to At-Tan`im or elsewhere – and enter Ihram from there. This was the view of the majority of scholars. Al-Muhibb At-Tabari (may Allah have mercy on him) said: I do not know of anyone who described Makkah as a Miqat for `Umrah.

So the phrase in the Hadith of Ibn `Abbas (may Allah be pleased with him) "the people of Makkah can start from Makkah" is interpreted as referring specifically to those who are performing Hajj combined with `Umrah (Qiran) or Hajj on its own, not those who are performing `Umrah on its own.

The significance of following the Prophet's (peace be upon him) actions

This is supported by the fact that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) was never given the choice between two things but he always chose the easier option, so long as it was not a sin. If entering Ihram for `Umrah from inside the Haram was permissible then he would have chosen that option for `A'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her), because it would have been easier and less burdensome for him and for `Aishah and her brother, and he would not have told her to go outside the Haram or to At-Tan`im and enter Ihram from there.

The fact that he did not choose the option of entering Ihram from inside the Haram, which would have been easier for everyone concerned, and he chose the option of entering Ihram from outside the Haram, which is more difficult, indicates that one should enter Ihram for `Umrah from outside the Haram, and that this is a shar'i requirement for the one who wants to perform `Umrah on its own and is already in the Haram. And Allah is the Source of strength.

(End quote from Al-Lajnah Ad-Da'imah, 11/143)

For more details, please see the following answers: 37734 and 69934.

And Allah knows best.