296503 - A prudent approach to wudu for women in the event of wind from the front passage

the question

I have a question about wind that comes from a woman’s front passage. In questions no. 111818 and 2175, you said that it does not break wudu, but in question no. 176951, you said that it does break wudu. So I do not know what I should do, because sometimes it comes out of me when I am praying and it makes a sound. So should I repeat the prayer if it makes a sound when it comes out, or not?

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

In question no. 176951 we did not give a definitive answer on this matter, and we did not say that the other view is wrong. Rather what we mentioned in this answer is that this issue is one of the issues concerning which there is a great difference of scholarly opinion, because there is no clear, authentic text concerning it. Therefore the most prudent approach is to err on the side of caution and do wudu in the case of this type of wind.

But this does not mean that we definitely say that prayer is invalid for a woman who experiences wind coming from the front passage, if she prayed and not repeat wudu. How could that be the case, when we mentioned the view of those scholars who say that her prayer is valid in this case?

Undoubtedly, if a woman does wudu after wind comes from her front passage, her prayer will be valid, according to scholarly consensus; she has not done anything to be blamed or criticised for, and she is not to be regarded as suffering from waswas (intrusive thoughts) or anything else. Doing acts of worship in a manner concerning which there is no difference of opinion as to whether it is valid is something that is recommended by the scholars.

An-Nawawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

The scholars are agreed that it is recommended to avoid matters concerning which the scholars differed, so long as that will not lead to undermining a Sunnah practice or falling into another matter concerning which the scholars differed.

(End quote from *Sharh Sahih Muslim*, 2/23).

The evidence for that is the hadith of an-Nu`man ibn Bashir (may Allah be pleased with him), who said: I heard the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) say: “That which is halal is clear and that which is haram is clear, and between them are doubtful matters which many people do not understand. Whoever guards against the doubtful matters will protect his religious commitment from shortcomings and will protect his honour from slander…” Narrated by al-Bukhari, 52; Muslim, 1599.

Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

As for avoiding matters concerning which the scholars differed, that is to be done as a precaution, if you do not know anything in the Sunnah to give you an answer and the facts of the matter are not clear, because the one who avoids dubious matters will protect his dignity and his faith. But when there is no doubt about a matter and the Sunnah is known, this idea is not applicable in that case.

(End quote from *Sharh `Umdat al-Fiqh*, 1/417).

Undoubtedly avoiding this matter concerning which there is a great deal of scholarly difference of opinion is something recommended, and avoiding it is not contrary to any other Sunnah. Rather it is something recommended by the apparent meaning of the evidence on the matter, as was mentioned in the answer referred to:

Undoubtedly in order to be on the safe side and to ensure that one has discharged one’s duty it is better to do wudu in the event of this wind, because there is such a strong difference of opinion concerning it and because this is more on the safe side, as we have said. It is also closer to the

apparent meaning of the evidence, because the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “There is no wudu unless there is a sound or a smell.” (Narrated by at-Tirmidhi, 74; he said: a hasan sahih hadith. It was classed as sahih by al-Albani in *Sahih al-Jami`*, no. 7572.)

This hadith and similar hadiths were quoted as evidence by Imam Ibn al-Mubarak and others that wudu is broken by wind that comes from the back passage.

And Allah knows best.