109238 - Should pilgrims who are residents of Makkah shorten their prayers in ‘Arafah, Muzdalifah and Mina?

the question

Should the pilgrim who is a resident of Makkah shorten his prayers in the places of the rituals?

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

The well-known view among the companions of the three imams – ash-Shaafa‘i, Maalik and Ahmad (may Allah have mercy on them) – is that the resident of Makkah should not shorten his prayers or put his prayers together, because he is not travelling, since what is regarded as travel is a distance of eighty-three kilometres or more. It is well-known that ‘Arafah is the furthest of the places of the rituals from Makkah, and it is not that far away. Based on that, the residents of Makkah should not put their prayers together or shorten their prayers; rather they should offer the prayers in full and offer each prayer at its own time, whether in ‘Arafah, Muzdalifah or Mina.

Abu Haneefah (may Allah have mercy on him) was of the view that they should put their prayers together and shorten them. He said: The reason for putting the prayers together and shortening them is the pilgrimage, not travel, so they should shorten their prayers even if they are in Mina, which is the closest of the holy places to Makkah.

But the correct view is that the reason for shortening the prayers in Mina, ‘Arafah and Muzdalifah is not the pilgrimage; rather the reason for that is travel, and travel is not defined by distance; rather it is defined by the situation, which means that if a person goes out and he makes preparations for this going out, and takes food and drink with him, then he is travelling.

Based on that, we say: At the time of the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) the people used to take provisions with them for Hajj, whether they were residents of Makkah or otherwise, therefore the people of Makkah who were with the Messenger (blessings and peace

of Allah be upon him) during the Farewell Pilgrimage put their prayers together and shortened them, following the Messenger (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him), and he did not say: O people of Makkah, offer your prayers in full. This is the more correct view, and it is the view favoured by Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah (may Allah have mercy on him).

According to the second view, which we regard as more correct, when a person is in Muzdalifah or in ‘Arafah, he is in a place that is separate from Makkah, so let him avail himself of the concession of travel. But when he is in Mina, Mina nowadays has become as if it is one of the neighbourhoods of Makkah, therefore we think that to be on the safe side, the resident of Makkah should not put his prayers together and not shorten them in Mina. Moreover, there is no putting together of prayers in Mina even for one who is not a resident of Makkah, because in Mina the Sunnah is for the non-resident of Makkah to shorten the prayers without putting them together. As for Muzdalifah and ‘Arafah, they are separate from Makkah, and are not connected to it as far as I have seen, because the built-up area is not connected to it. Whatever the case, if we assume that Makkah grows larger in the future and Muzdalifah becomes part of it like Mina, then the ruling will be the same. End quote.